## BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BO UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION WASHINGTON, D.C.

	Î		æ	
N AGEN	ICY MAY	2 7	2009	
Cler INIT	k, Environ IALS	mental	Appeals Bo	bard

		minto	
		<u> </u>	
In re:		)	
Desert Rock Energy Company, LLC		) PSD Appeal Nos. 08-03, 08-04,	
		08-05 & 08-06	
PSD Permit No. AZP 04-01			
		)	

# ORDER GRANTING MOTION REQUESTING RECONSIDERATION OF MOTION TO PARTICIPATE AND PERMISSION TO FILE AMICUS CURIAE BRIEF OUT OF TIME

On April 27, 2009, United States EPA Region 9 ("Region") filed a motion with the Environmental Appeals Board ("Board") requesting a voluntary remand of the final prevention of significant deterioration ("PSD") permit (number AZP 04-01) ("the Permit") it had issued to Desert Rock Energy Company, LLC ("Desert Rock") on July 31, 2008. *See generally* EPA Region 9's Motion for Voluntary Remand ("Motion for Voluntary Remand"). The Permit is the subject of four petitions for review currently before the Board pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 124.19.¹ The Board instructed the other ten current participants in the above-captioned permit appeal who wished to respond to the Region's Motion for Voluntary Remand to do so by June 11, 2009. *See* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The following parties filed petitions in this matter: Diné Care, Environmental Defense Fund, Grand Canyon Trust, Natural Resources Defense Council, San Juan Citizens Alliance, Sierra Club, and WildEarth Guardians; the State of New Mexico; Center for Biological Diversity; and Ms. Leslie Glustrom. In addition to the four Petitioners and the Region, the following entities have filed responses, amicus curiae, and/or nonparty briefs in the matter: the Navajo Nation, Desert Rock, the National Parks Conservation Association, the Diné Power Authority, the New Mexico Building and Construction Trades Council, and Physicians for Social Responsibility.

Revised Order Granting Motion for Extension of Time to Respond to Region's Motion for Voluntary Remand at 3 (May 5, 2009).

On May 19, 2009, the Board received a motion from the American Coalition for Clean Coal Electricity ("ACCCE") requesting the Board grant it leave to file a brief opposing the Region's motion. *See generally* Motion to Participate at 1. ACCCE characterizes itself as "a non-profit organization formed by the nation's coal-producing companies, railroads, a number of electric utilities, and related organizations for the purpose of educating the public (including public-sector decision-makers) about the benefits of affordable, reliable and environmentally compatible coal-fueled energy." *Id.* Some of ACCCE's members include suppliers of coal, including BHP Billton, the "owner of BHP Navajo Coal Company, [which] would be the supplier of coal to the [Desert Rock] plant." *Id.* at 4.

The Board denied ACCCE's motion, explaining that the Board had previously established March 5, 2009, as the deadline by which all persons wanting to participate in this proceeding were to file a brief and that ACCCE's motion was therefore untimely filed. *See* Order Denying Motion to Participate at 2-3 (May 21, 2009). The Board further noted that ACCCE had not explained why it had failed to file a timely request to participate in this matter under the schedule previously outlined by the Board in its Order Granting Review and in the public notice issued by the Region. *Id.* at 3.

On May 22, 2009, ACCCE filed a motion asking the Board to reconsider its Motion to Participate in which it provided a further explanation regarding its late amicus curiae request.

See Motion Requesting Reconsideration of Motion to Participate and Permission to File Amicus Curiae Brief Out of Time ("Motion Requesting Reconsideration"). ACCCE argues that "[w]ith

EPA's filing of its Voluntary Motion for Remand, the agency materially changed the circumstances of the appeal pending before this Board." *Id.* at 1-2. ACCCE explains that it had "elected not to participate prior to EPA's filing of its Motion for Voluntary Remand because EPA had not taken a position that could be of harm to ACCCE's members, as EPA has now done." *Id.* at 2. ACCCE points out that EPA filed its Motion for Voluntary Remand 53 days after the deadline for filing amicus briefs. *Id.* at 1. ACCCE also argues that, if granted, EPA's Motion for Voluntary Remand "will significantly alter the process by which EPA may consider and evaluate PSD permits" and that "[t]he potential adverse precedential effect of this change" will be significant. *Id.* at 2. ACCCE asserts that, unlike any other current participant in this proceeding, it "represents the interests of so many entities and organizations related to the coalfueled electricity industry." *Id.* Finally, ACCCE states that it does not want time to respond beyond that already afforded to the current participants. *Id.* 

The mere fact that the Agency is reconsidering its position is not, by itself, sufficient grounds for the Board's acceptance of a late-filed motion to participate and/or amicus curiae brief. In this case, however, the Region has indicated that it is reconsidering its position on several issues. *See, e.g.*, Motion for Voluntary Remand at 8-25 (referring to, among other things, reconsideration of its determinations regarding MACT for hazardous air pollutants, the use of Integrated Gasification Combined Cycle Technology under its BACT analysis, and its approach to the Endangered Species Act). Furthermore, as ACCCE notes, the Region's request for a voluntary remand in order to reconsider its position occurred after the close of the period for the filing of amicus curiae briefs by interested persons. Motion Requesting Reconsideration at 1. ACCCE, moreover, contends that it represents interests beyond those represented by the current

participants in this matter, such as coal suppliers. See, e.g., id. at 5; Motion to Participate at 4.

Finally, because the Board has granted the current participants time to respond to the Region's

motion, allowing ACCCE to file a brief within this same time frame will not delay this

proceeding. Thus, on balance, the Board concludes that, in light of the unique circumstances in

this case and the fact that no prejudice will result from granting the motion, it is appropriate to

grant the belated motion to participate and allow for the filing of an out of time brief.

Accordingly, based upon the foregoing, the Board hereby GRANTS ACCCE's motion

requesting reconsideration of its motion to participate and permission to file an amicus curiae

brief out of time. ACCCE may file an amicus curiae brief in this proceeding no later than June

11, 2009, the date the Board has established for the filing of all responses to the Region's Motion

for Voluntary Remand. The same length and formatting restrictions apply to ACCCE as outlined

in the Board's May 5, 2009 Order. See Revised Order Granting Motion for Extension of Time to

Respond to Region's Motion for Voluntary Remand at 3.

So ordered.

ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BOARD

Kathie A. Stein

Environmental Appeals Judge

Date: May 27, 2009

4

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Order Granting Motion Requesting Reconsideration of Motion to Participate and Permission to File Amicus Curiae Brief Out of Time in the matter of Desert Rock Energy Company, LLC, PSD Appeal Nos. 08-03, 08-04, 08-05, & 08-06 were sent to the following persons in the manner indicated:

### **By Inter-Office Mail:**

Brian L. Doster Kristi M. Smith Elliott Zenick Air and Radiation Law Office Office of General Counsel Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, DC 20460 Fax: (202) 564-5603

#### **By Pouch Mail:**

Deborah Jordan Director, Air Division (AIR-3) EPA Region 9 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105-3901 Fax: (415) 947-3579

Ann Lyons Office of Regional Counsel EPA Region 9 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105-3901 Fax: (415) 947-3570

#### By First Class Mail:

Seth T. Cohen Assistant Attorney General P.O. Drawer 1508 Santa Fe, NM 87504-1508 Fax: (505) 827-4440

Leslie Barnhart
Eric Ames
Special Assistant Attorneys General
New Mexico Environment Department
P.O. Box 26110
Santa Fe, NM 87502-6110
Fax: (505) 827-1628

Nicholas Persampieri EarthJustice 1400 Glenarm Place, #300 Denver, CO 80202 Fax: (303) 623-8083

Patrice Simms
Natural Resources Defense Council
1200 New York Ave., NW, Suite 400
Washington, DC 20005
Fax: (202) 289-1060

John Barth P.O. Box 409 Hygiene, CO 80533 Fax: (303) 774-8899

Amy R. Atwood Public Lands Program Center for Biological Diversity P.O. Box 11374 Portland, OR 97211-0374 Fax: (503) 283-5528

Stephanie Kodish Clean Air Counsel National Parks Conservation Association 706 Walnut Street, Suite 200 Knoxville, TN 37902

Louis Denetsosie, Attorney General D. Harrison Tsosie, Deputy Attorney General Navajo Nation Department of Justice P.O. Box 2010 Old Club Building Window Rock, AZ 86515 Fax: (928) 871-6177 Anne Brewster Weeks Clean Air Task Force 18 Tremont Street, Suite 530 Boston, MA 02108 Fax: (617) 624-0230

Kevin Lynch Environmental Defense Fund Climate and Air Program 2334 N. Broadway Boulder, CO 80304 Fax: (303) 440-8052

Leslie Glustrom 4492 Burr Place Boulder, CO 80303

Jeffrey R. Holmstead Richard Alonso Bracewell & Giuliani LLP 2000 K Street, N.W. Washington DC 20006 Fax: (202) 857-4812 Fax: (202) 857-4824

Douglas C. MacCourt Michael J. Sandmire AterWynne, LLP 1331 NW Lovejoy Portland, OR 97209-2785 Fax: (503) 226-0079

Kristen Welker-Hood, DSC MSN RN Director of Environment and Health Progs. Physicians for Social Responsibility 1875 Connecticut Ave., N.W. Suite 1012 Washington, D.C. 20009 Fax: (202) 667-4201 Justin Lesky Law Office of Justin Lesky 8210 La Mirada Place NE Suite 600 Albuquerque, NM 78109

Dated: MAY 2 7 2009

Paul M. Seby Marian C. Larsen Moye White LLP 1400 16th Street #600 Denver, CO 80202 Fax: (303) 292-4510

Annette Duncan

Secretary